

# WBL Methodology Workshop



WORLD BANK GROUP





# Pay

Safety	Mobility	Work	Pay	Marriage
Parenthood	Childcare	Entrepreneurship	Assets	Pension

# Pay – Getting started



# Pay – Motivation



- On average, working women around the world earn around **20 percent less** than men (ILO 2019).
- **Equal pay** has the potential to improve women's economic opportunities and is grounded in ILO Convention 100.
- **Laws restricting the economic sectors and hours** in which women can work widens the gender wage gap and decreases productivity (Blau and Kahn 2017).
- **Sex-disaggregated data on employment and salaries** can improve understanding of how macroeconomic changes affect women and inform policymaking (Doss 2014; Doss and Kieran 2014).
- **Pay transparency measures** contribute to decreasing the gender pay gap by allowing women to identify and challenge unfair pay practices (Kulow 2013; Reshi and Sudha 2023).
- **Gender-sensitive occupational safety and health public policies** promote equal employment opportunities (ILO 2013).
- **Incentives for women to work in STEM fields** expand economic opportunities (Funk and Fry 2021).



# Pillar I – Pay Legal Frameworks



## Underlying questions

01

Does the Law Mandate Equal Remuneration for Work of Equal Value?

- No underlying data points.

02

Can a Woman Work at Night in the Same Way as a Man?

- No underlying data points.

03

Can a Woman Work in a Job Deemed Dangerous in the Same Way as a Man?

- Can a woman work in a job deemed hazardous, arduous and morally inappropriate in the same way as a man?
- Is the law free of legal provisions that explicitly give the relevant government authority the power to restrict or prohibit women from working in jobs deemed dangerous?

04

Can a Woman Work in Different Economic Sectors in the Same Way as a Man?

- Can a woman work in the mining, construction, manufacturing, agriculture, transportation, energy, and water sectors in the same way as a man?
- Is the law free of legal provisions that explicitly give the relevant government authority the power to restrict or prohibit women from working in different economic sectors?

# Pillar I – Pay Legal Frameworks – I.4.1



	Points	Rescaled Maximum Score
I.4.1 Does the Law Mandate Equal Remuneration for Work of Equal Value?	0 or 1	25

Question I.4.1 is assigned a score of 1 if the following three conditions is met:

- ▶ The law mandates that employers pay equal remuneration to male and female employees who perform work of equal value in accordance with the definitions of “remuneration” and “work of equal value” provided by the ILO; AND
- ▶ The law does not limit the principle of equal remuneration to equal work, the same work, similar work, or work of a similar nature; AND
- ▶ The law does not limit the broad concept of “remuneration” to only basic wages or salary.

## International Standard

The terms “remuneration” and “work of equal value” are defined in alignment with the **ILO Equal Remuneration Convention, 1951 (No. 100)**.

“**Remuneration**” refers to the ordinary, basic, or minimum wage or salary and any additional emoluments payable directly or indirectly, whether in cash or in kind, by the employer to the worker and arising from the worker’s employment.

“**Work of equal value**” refers not only to the same or similar jobs, but also to different jobs of the same value—that is, work that may be different in nature but is of equal value in terms of factors such as skill, effort, responsibility, and working conditions.

# Pillar I – Pay Legal Frameworks – I.4.2



	Points	Rescaled Maximum Score
I.4.2 Can a Woman Work at Night in the Same Way as a Man?	0 or 1	25

Question I.4.2 is assigned a score of 1 if the following three conditions is met:

- ▶ The law does not prohibit a woman who is not pregnant and not nursing from working at night in the same way as a man; AND
- ▶ The law does not broadly prohibit a woman, including one with children over the age of one, from working at night and does not limit the hours that she can work at night; AND
- ▶ The law does not give the relevant authority the power to restrict or prohibit a woman's ability to work at night, regardless of any decisions issued by that authority.

## International Standard

The term "industrial undertaking" aligns with the **ILO Hours of Work (Industry) Convention, 1919 (No. 1)**, and the **ILO Employment Injury Benefits Convention, 1964 (No. 121)**.

The term encompasses all activities in the following economic sectors: mining and quarrying, manufacturing, construction, electricity, gas, and water and sanitary services, as well as transport, storage, and communication.



# Pillar I – Pay Legal Frameworks – I.4.3



	Points	Rescaled Maximum Score
<b>I.4.3 Can a Woman Work in a Job Deemed Dangerous in the Same Way as a Man?</b>	0 or 0.25	25
I.4.3.1 Can a woman work in a job deemed hazardous in the same way as a man?	0 or 0.25	
I.4.3.2 Can a woman work in a job deemed arduous in the same way as a man?	0 or 0.25	
I.4.3.3 Can a woman work in a job deemed morally inappropriate in the same way as a man?	0 or 0.25	
I.4.3.4 Is the law free of legal provisions that explicitly give the relevant government authority the power to restrict or prohibit women from working in jobs deemed dangerous?	0 or 0.25	

## I.4.3.1 Can a woman work in a job deemed hazardous in the same way as a man?

Question I.4.3.1 is assigned a score of 0.25 if no laws prohibit or restrict a woman who is not pregnant and not nursing from working in a broad and subjective category of jobs deemed hazardous.

## I.4.3.2 Can a woman work in a job deemed arduous in the same way as a man?

Question I.4.3.2 is assigned a score of 0.25 if no laws prohibit or restrict a woman who is not pregnant and not nursing from working in a broad and subjective category of jobs deemed arduous.

## I.4.3.3 Can a woman work in a job deemed morally inappropriate in the same way as a man?

Question I.4.3.3 is assigned a score of 0.25 if no laws prohibit or restrict a woman who is not pregnant and not nursing from working in a broad and subjective category of jobs deemed morally inappropriate.

## I.4.3.4 Are leave benefits paid solely by the employer?

Question I.4.3.4 is assigned a score of 0.25 if the law does not give the relevant authority the power to prohibit or restrict a woman's ability to work in jobs considered dangerous, such as by determining whether particular jobs are too hazardous, arduous, or morally inappropriate for a woman but not for a man, regardless of any decisions issued by that authority.



# Pillar I – Pay Legal Frameworks – I.4.4



	Points	Rescaled Maximum Score
I.4.4 Can a Woman Work in Different Economic Sectors in the Same Way as a Man?	0-1	25
I.4.4.1 – 1.4.4.7 Can a woman work in the [ <i>mining, construction, manufacturing, agriculture, transportation, energy, water</i> ] sector in the same way as a man?		
I.4.4.8 Is the law free of legal provisions that explicitly give the relevant government authority the power to restrict or prohibit women from working in different economic sectors?		

Questions I.4.4.1 to I.4.4.7 receive a qualifying response of YES if the following two conditions are met:

- ▶ No laws prohibit or restrict a woman who is not pregnant and not nursing from working in the mining, construction, manufacturing, agriculture, transportation, energy, OR water sectors respectively; AND
- ▶ A woman's employment in the mining, construction, manufacturing, agriculture, transportation, energy, or water sectors is not restricted in any other way, such as by prohibiting her from working at night in "industrial undertakings."

# Questions from 1.4.4.1 to 1.4.4.8 = Yes	Score (0-1)
8 YES responses	1
6 or 7 YES responses	0.75
4 or 5 YES responses	0.50
2 or 3 YES responses	0.25
0 or 1 YES responses	0

I.4.4.8 Is the law free of legal provisions that explicitly give the relevant government authority the power to restrict or prohibit women from working in different economic sectors?

Question I.4.4.8 receives a qualifying response of YES if the law does not give the relevant authority the power to prohibit or restrict a woman's ability to work in different economic sectors, regardless of any decisions issued by that authority.

# Pillar II – Pay Supportive Frameworks



01

Does the Government Publish Anonymized Sex-Disaggregated Data on Employment and Salaries in Different Economic Sectors?

## Underlying questions

- Does the government publish sex-disaggregated data on employment in different economic sectors?
- Does the government publish sex-disaggregated data on salaries in different economic sectors?

02

Are There Pay Transparency Measures to Address the Pay Gap or Mechanisms to Enforce Equal Pay Legislation?

- Are there pay transparency measures in place to address the pay gap?
- Are there enforcement mechanisms to ensure compliance with equal pay legislation?

03

Are There Gender-Sensitive Occupational Safety and Health (OSH) Public Policies Applicable to the Private Sector?

- No underlying data points

04

Are There Government-led Initiatives Aimed at Incentivizing Women to Work in Science, Technology, Engineering, and Mathematics (STEM) Fields?

- No underlying data points

# Pillar II – Pay Supportive Frameworks – II.4.1



	Points	Rescaled Maximum Score
II.4.1. Does the Government Publish Anonymized Sex-Disaggregated Data on Employment and Salaries in Different Economic Sectors?	0 - 1	25
II.4.1.1 Does the government publish sex-disaggregated data on employment in different economic sectors?	0 or 0.50	
II.4.1.2 Does the government publish sex-disaggregated data on salaries in different economic sectors?	0 or 0.50	

## II.4.1.2 Does the government publish sex-disaggregated data on employment in different economic sectors?

Question II.4.1.2 is assigned a score of 0.50 if the following four conditions are met:

- ▶ A public entity or national statistical office has collected and published sex-disaggregated data on actual *salaries* across different economic sectors; AND
- ▶ Same as conditions 2-4 in 11.4.1.1.

## II.4.1.1 Does the government publish sex-disaggregated data on employment in different economic sectors?

Question II.4.1.1 is assigned a score of 0.50 if the following four conditions are met:

- ▶ A public entity or national statistical office has collected and published sex-disaggregated data on *employment rates* across different economic sectors; AND
- ▶ The data are available for at least four economic sectors—such as mining, construction, manufacturing, energy, water, agriculture, transportation, and services; AND
- ▶ The data were published within the past three years preceding the data collection cutoff date; AND
- ▶ The data are presented in a structured and comprehensive table format suitable for analysis and interpretation, either on a government-associated website or in an associated report. Data can be presented in either exact figures or percentages. Data presented in descriptive summary format only, or only available in secondary sources such as press releases or generalized statements about women's labor force participation in different economic sectors, are insufficient.

# Pillar II – Pay Supportive Frameworks – II.4.2



	Points	Rescaled Maximum Score
II.4.2 Are There Pay Transparency Measures to Address the Pay Gap or Mechanisms to Enforce Equal Pay Legislation?	0 or 1	25
II.4.2.1 Does the government require the private sector to put in place pay transparency measures to address the pay gap?	The response to at least one of the questions must be YES to obtain 1 point	
II.4.2.2 Has the government introduced enforcement mechanisms to ensure private sector compliance with equal pay legislation?		

## II.4.2.1 Does the government require the private sector to put in place pay transparency measures to address the pay gap?

Question II.4.2.1 is assigned a response of YES if the following two conditions are met:

- ▶ The government requires the private sector to put in place pay transparency measures to address the gender pay gap; AND
- ▶ Existing pay transparency measures are mandatory.

## II.4.2.2 Has the government introduced enforcement mechanisms to ensure private sector compliance with equal pay legislation?

Question II.4.2.2 is assigned a response of YES if the following two conditions are met:

- ▶ The government has introduced enforcement mechanisms to ensure private sector compliance with equal pay legislation; AND
- ▶ Existing enforcement mechanisms are mandatory.

## Pillar II – Pay Supportive Frameworks – II.4.3



	Points	Rescaled Maximum Score
II.4.3 Are There Gender-Sensitive Occupational Safety and Health (OSH) Public Policies Applicable to the Private Sector?	0 or 1	25

Indicator II.4.3 is assigned a score of 1 if the following three conditions are met:

- ▶ The law does not prohibit women from working in certain jobs or economic sectors, or during certain hours, as assessed under questions I.4.2, I.4.3 and I.4.4; AND
- ▶ There is an active occupational safety and health policy, at either the national, state, or municipal level (that is, a country's main business city); AND
- ▶ The policy explicitly considers either women's occupational safety and health, specific risks that disproportionately affect working women (such as reproductive hazards, violence at work, stressful workplace factors, inadequate personal protective equipment, tools and machinery, among others), or the establishment of a national institute that examines gender issues in occupational safety and health.

**“Occupational safety and health (OSH)”** refers to the science of the anticipation, recognition, evaluation, and control of hazards arising in or from the workplace that could impair the health and well-being of workers, taking into account the possible impact on the surrounding communities and the general environment (Alli 2008).

**“Gender-sensitive”** refers to the ability to acknowledge gender differences and incorporate those differences into strategies and actions (UNDP 2007).

## Pillar II – Pay Supportive Frameworks – II.4.4



	Points	Rescaled Maximum Score
II.4.4 Are There Government-led Initiatives Aimed at Incentivizing Women to Work in Science, Technology, Engineering, and Mathematics (STEM) Fields?	0 or 1	25

Indicator II.4.4 receives a score of 1 if the following two conditions are met:

- ▶ There is at least one initiative administered or at least partially funded by a public entity to incentivize women to work in science, technology, engineering, and mathematics (STEM) fields; AND
- ▶ The initiative is in effect during the reporting cycle or has been published within the past five years preceding the data collection cutoff date if there is no expiration date specified in the document.

“**Initiative**” is defined as structured programs, policies, or set of actions undertaken and/or supported by governments and public institutions to incentivize women to work in STEM fields. These initiatives may include public policy programs, public awareness campaigns, provision of support services, informational or training programs, and scholarships, among others.

“**STEM**” is defined as computer and mathematical, architecture and engineering, and life and physical science occupations, as well as managerial and postsecondary teaching occupations related to these functional areas and sales occupations requiring scientific or technical knowledge at the postsecondary level, in alignment with the United States Bureau of Labor Statistics (US BLS 2024).

# Pillar III – Pay Enforcement Perceptions



01

In Your Opinion, To What Extent Do Public Authorities *Enforce* Existing Legislation on Equal Remuneration for Work of Equal Value between Women and Men in Practice?

02

In Your Opinion, To What Extent Do Public Authorities *Enforce* Existing Legislation *Restricting* a Woman's Right to Work at Night in Practice? (OR)

In Your Opinion, To What Extent Do Public Authorities *Uphold* Equal Rights between Women and Men to Work at Night in Practice?

03

In Your Opinion, To What Extent Do Public Authorities *Enforce* Existing Legislation *Restricting* a Woman's Right to Work in a Job Deemed Dangerous in Practice? (AND/OR)

In Your Opinion, To What Extent Do Public Authorities *Uphold* Equal Rights between Women and Men to Work in a Job Deemed Dangerous in Practice?

04

In Your Opinion, To What Extent Do Public Authorities *Enforce* Existing Legislation *Restricting* Women's Right to Work in an Economic Sector in Practice? (AND/OR)

In Your Opinion, To What Extent Do Public Authorities *Uphold* Equal Rights between Women and Men to Work in an Economic Sector in Practice?

## Likert Scale Responses

- Not at all enforced
- Rarely enforced
- Moderately enforced
- Mostly enforced
- Fully enforced

- Fully enforced (OR) Not at all upheld
- Mostly enforced (OR) Rarely upheld
- Moderately enforced (OR) Moderately upheld
- Rarely enforced (OR) Mostly upheld
- Not at all enforced (OR) Fully upheld



# Pillar III – Pay Enforcement Perceptions – III.4.1



The Enforcement Perception question III.4.1 is displayed according to the score of I.4.1 Does the Law Mandate Equal Remuneration for Work of Equal Value?

If the score is 0:

No Enforcement Perception question is asked.

The economy obtains a score of 0 on indicator III.4.1

If the score is 1:

**III.4.1** In Your Opinion, To What Extent Do Public Authorities **Enforce** Existing Legislation on Equal Remuneration for Work of Equal Value between Women and Men in Practice?

Response Options	Scores (0-4)	Weighted Score (0-100)
Not at all enforced	0	0
Rarely enforced	1	25
Moderately enforced	2	50
Mostly enforced	3	75
Fully enforced	4	100

# Pillar III – Pay Enforcement Perceptions – III.4.2.1 and III.4.2.2



The Enforcement Perception questions III.4.2.1 and III.4.2.2 are displayed according to the score of I.4.2 Can a Woman Work at Night in the Same Way as a Man?

If the score is 0:

**III.4.2.1** In Your Opinion, To What Extent Do Public Authorities **Enforce** Existing Legislation Restricting a Woman's Right to Work at Night in Practice?

Response Options	Scores (0-4)	Weighted Scores (0-100)
Not at all enforced	4	100
Rarely enforced	3	75
Moderately enforced	2	50
Mostly enforced	1	25
Fully enforced	0	0

If the score is 1:

**III.4.2.2** In Your Opinion, To What Extent Do Public Authorities **Uphold** Equal Rights between Women and Men to Work at Night in Practice?

Response Options	Scores (0-4)	Weighted Score (0-100)
Not at all upheld	0	0
Rarely upheld	1	25
Moderately upheld	2	50
Mostly upheld	3	75
Fully upheld	4	100

# Pillar III – Pay Enforcement Perceptions – III.4.3.1 and III.4.3.2



The Enforcement Perception questions III.4.3.1 and III.4.3.2 are displayed according to the score of I.4.3 Can a Woman Work in a Job Deemed Dangerous in the Same Way as a Man?

If the score is 0: (OR)

If the score of any of the questions (I.4.3.1, I.4.3.2 or I.4.3.3) is 0:

**III.4.3.1** In Your Opinion, To What Extent Do Public Authorities **Enforce** Existing Legislation Restricting a Woman's Right to Work in a Job Deemed Dangerous in Practice?

If the score is 1: (OR)

If the score of any of the questions (I.4.3.1, I.4.3.2 or I.4.3.3) is 0.25:

**III.4.3.2** In Your Opinion, To What Extent Do Public Authorities **Uphold** Equal Rights between Women and Men to Work in a Job Deemed Dangerous in Practice?

Response Options	Scores (0-4)	Weighted Score (0-100)
Not at all enforced	4	100 multiplied by (1 minus indicator score for 1.4.3)
Rarely enforced	3	75 multiplied by (1 minus indicator score for 1.4.3)
Moderately enforced	2	50 multiplied by (1 minus indicator score for 1.4.3)
Mostly enforced	1	25 multiplied by (1 minus indicator score for 1.4.3)
Fully enforced	0	0

Response Options	Scores (0-4)	Weighted Score (0-100)
Not at all upheld	0	0
Rarely upheld	1	25 multiplied by indicator score for 1.4.3
Moderately upheld	2	50 multiplied by indicator score for 1.4.3
Mostly upheld	3	75 multiplied by indicator score for 1.4.3
Fully upheld	4	100 multiplied by indicator score for 1.4.3

# Pillar III – Pay Enforcement Perceptions – III.4.4.1 and III.4.4.2



The Enforcement Perception questions III.4.4.1 and III.4.4.2 are displayed according to the score of I.4.4 Can a Woman Work in Different Economic Sectors in the Same Way as a Man?

If the score is 0: (OR)

If the score of any of the questions (I.4.4.1- I.4.4.7) is 0:

If the score is 1: (OR)

If the score of any of the questions (I.4.4.1 – I.4.4.7) is greater than 0:

**III.4.4.1** In Your Opinion, To What Extent Do Public Authorities **Enforce** Existing Legislation Restricting a Woman's Right to Work in an Economic Sector in Practice?

**III.4.4.2** In Your Opinion, To What Extent Do Public Authorities **Uphold** Equal Rights between Women and Men to Work in an Economic Sector in Practice?

Response Options	Scores (0-4)	Weighted Score (0-100)
Not at all enforced	4	100 multiplied by (1 minus indicator score for I.4.4)
Rarely enforced	3	75 multiplied by (1 minus indicator score for I.4.4)
Moderately enforced	2	50 multiplied by (1 minus indicator score for I.4.4)
Mostly enforced	1	25 multiplied by (1 minus indicator score for I.4.4)
Fully enforced	0	0

Response Options	Scores (0-4)	Weighted Score (0-100)
Not at all upheld	0	0
Rarely upheld	1	25 multiplied by indicator score for I.4.4
Moderately upheld	2	50 multiplied by indicator score for I.4.4
Mostly upheld	3	75 multiplied by indicator score for I.4.4
Fully upheld	4	100 multiplied by indicator score for I.4.4